

APPENDIX I: National Register Significance and Integrity Evaluations

The information in this section is largely excerpted and paraphrased from National Register Bulletin 15, *How to Use the National Register Criteria for Evaluation* (Shrimpton 2002).

Significance

To determine whether a property is eligible for the National Register of Historic Places, it is necessary to apply the National Register Criteria for Evaluation:

The quality of significance in American history, architecture, archeology, engineering, and culture is present in districts, sites, buildings, structures, and objects that possess integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association, and:

- A. That are associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history; or
- B. That are associated with the lives of significant persons in our past;
- C. That embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, or that represent the work of a master, or that possess high artistic values, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction; or
- D. That have yielded or may be likely to yield, information important in history or prehistory.

Criteria Considerations

Ordinarily cemeteries, birthplaces, graves of historical figures, properties owned by religious institutions or used for religious purposes, structures that have been moved from their original locations, reconstructed historic buildings, properties primarily commemorative in nature, and properties that have achieved significant within the past 50 years shall not be considered eligible for the National Register. However, such properties *will qualify* if they are integral parts of districts that do meet the criteria or if they fall within the following categories:

- a. a religious property deriving primary significance from architectural or artistic distinction or historical importance; or
- b. a building or structure removed from its original location but which is primarily significant for architectural value, or which is the surviving structure most importantly associated with a historic person or event; or
- c. a birthplace or grave of a historical figure of outstanding importance if there is no appropriate site or building associated with his or her productive life; or
- d. a cemetery that derives its primary importance from graves of persons of transcendence importance, from age, from distinctive design features, or from association with historic events; or
- e. a reconstructed building when accurately executed in a suitable environment and presented in a dignified manner as part of a restoration master plan, and when no other building or structure with the same association has survived; or
- f. a property primarily commemorative in intent if design, age, tradition, or symbolic value has invested it with its own exceptional significance; or

- g. a property achieving significance within the past 50 years if it is of exceptional significance.

The primary basis for evaluating a property's significance and, ultimately, its eligibility under the above criteria is *historic context*.

Criterion A

To be considered eligible under Criterion A, a property must be associated with either a specific event marking an important moment in American prehistory or history or a pattern of events or a historic trend that has made a significant contribution to the development of a community, state, or the nation. In addition, the property must have an important association with the events or historic trends, it must retain historic integrity.

Examples of properties associated with specific events include the site of a battle, the building in which an important invention was developed, or a factory district where a significant strike occurred. Examples of properties associated with a pattern of events include a road associated with initial settlement of an area, a railroad station that served as the focus of a community's transportation system, or a mill district representative of the importance of textile manufacturing during a particular period.

Criterion B

Criterion B applies to properties associated with individuals whose activities are demonstrably important within a local, state or national context. This criterion is usually restricted to those properties associated with a person's productive life that illustrate a person's important achievements. The persons associated with the property must be individually significant within a historic context. For example, the residence of a doctor, a mayor, or a merchant may be eligible under Criterion B if the person was significant in the field of medicine, politics or commerce, respectively.

Criterion C

As noted, eligibility under Criterion C requires the property to meet one or more of the following requirements: embody distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction; represent the work of a master; or possess high artistic values. Distinctive characteristics are physical features or traits that commonly recur in individual types, periods, or methods of construction. To be eligible for "distinctive characteristics" a property must clearly illustrate:

- the patterns of features common to a particular class of resources,
- the individuality or variation of features that occurs within the class,
- the evolution of that class, or
- the transition between classes of resources.

For example, a building eligible under the theme of the Gothic Revival must have the distinctive characteristics that make up the qualities of the style, such as pointed gables, steep roof pitch, board and batten siding, and ornamental bargeboard trim.

"Type, period of method of construction" refers to the way properties are related to one another by cultural tradition or function, by dates of construction of style, or by choice or availability of

materials and technology. A property is eligible if it is an important example of building practices of a particular time in history.

A master is a figure of generally recognized greatness in a field, a known craftsman of consummate skill, or an anonymous craftsman whose work is distinguishable from others by its characteristic style and quality. The property must express a particular phase in the development of the master's career, an aspect of his or her work, or a particular idea or theme in his or her craft. A property is not eligible as the work of a master simply because it was designed by a prominent architect.

"High artistic values" may be expressed in numerous ways. A property is eligible for high artistic values if it so fully articulates a particular concept of design that it expresses an artistic ideal. An example could be a building that represents a classic expression of the design theories of the Craftsman Style, such as carefully detailed handwork.

Criterion D

Some research questions about human history can be answered only by the actual physical material of cultural resources. Criterion D encompasses properties that have the potential to answer these types of research questions. The most common type of property nominated under this Criterion is an archeological site, although buildings, objects and structures can also be eligible for information potential.

For archeological sites, Criterion D applies to properties that contain or are likely to contain information bearing on an important archeological research question. In order for buildings, structures or objects to be eligible under Criterion D, they must be, or must have been the principal source of important information. For example, a building exhibiting a local variation on a standard design or construction technique could be eligible under Criterion D if study could yield important information, such as how local availability of materials or construction expertise affected the evolution of local building development.

Criteria Considerations

To possess eligibility under one of the above-mentioned criteria considerations, a property must meet one or more of the four Criteria for Evaluation. Considering the identified properties located within the study corridor, criteria considerations D and G may be applicable. The remaining criteria considerations are not expected to be applicable.

Criteria Consideration D

A cemetery is a collection of graves that is marked by stones or other artifacts or that is unmarked but recognizable by features such as fencing or depressions, or through maps, or by means of testing. A cemetery may be eligible if it contains graves of person of great eminence in their fields or who have had a great impact on the history of their community, state or nation. A cemetery may also be eligible if it has achieved historic significance for its relative great age in a particular geographic or cultural context. A cemetery may be eligible on the basis of distinctive design values including aesthetic or technical achievement in the fields of city planning, architecture, landscape architecture, engineering, mortuary art, or sculpture. A cemetery may also be eligible for association with historic events or if it has the potential to yield important information.

Criteria Consideration G

Because 50 years is a general estimate of the time needed to develop historical perspective and to evaluate significance, properties that have achieved significance within the past fifty years are generally not eligible for the National Register. Exceptions are made for “exceptional importance” including the extraordinary importance of an event or to an entire category of resources so fragile that survivors of any age are unusual. Examples of properties deemed to possess “exceptional importance” are the launch pad at Cape Canaveral from which men first traveled to the moon, and the Chrysler Building in New York significant as the epitome of the “Style Moderne” architecture.

Integrity

National Register eligibility requires that a property possess both significance and integrity. Integrity may be defined as the ability of a property to convey its significance. Historic properties either retain integrity or they do not. Within the concept of integrity, the National Register criteria recognize seven aspects that define integrity. To retain integrity, a property will always possess several, and usually most, of the aspects. These aspects of integrity include location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling and association.

Location

Location is the place where the historic property was constructed or the place where the historic event occurred. To retain integrity of location, the historic property cannot have been moved.

Design

Design is the combination of elements that create the form, plan, space, structure, and style of the property. Design includes such elements as organization of space, proportion, scale, technology, ornamental and materials. To retain integrity of design, the property must retain the primary design elements from its period of significance including pattern of fenestration; types of exterior cladding; and amount, type or style of ornamental detailing.

Setting

Setting is the physical environment of a historic property. It refers to the character of the place in which the property played its historical role. Physical features that constitute the setting include topographic features, vegetation, manmade features such as paths and fences, and relationships between buildings and other features or open space. If the property’s setting contributes to its significance the character of its setting must be little changed from the period of its significance.

Materials

Materials are the physical elements that were combined or deposited during a particular period of time and in a particular pattern or configuration to form a historic property. To retain integrity of materials, a property must retain the key exterior materials dating from the period of its historic significance.

Workmanship

Workmanship is the physical evidence of the crafts of a particular culture or people during any given period in history or prehistory. It is the evidence of artisans' labor or skill in constructing or altering a building. Examples of workmanship in historic buildings include tooling, carving, painting, graining, turning, and joinery. If manifestations of workmanship were visible during the property's period of significance, these manifestations must remain evident for the property to retain integrity of workmanship.

Feeling

Feeling is a property's expression of the aesthetic or historic sense of a particular period of time. It results from the presence of physical features that, taken together, convey the property's historic character. To retain integrity of feeling, the property must continue to evoke the feelings of its period of significance. For example, a rural historic district retaining original design, materials, workmanship, and setting will relate the feeling of agricultural life in the nineteenth century.

Association

Association is the direct link between an important historic event or person and a historic property. A property retains association if it is the place where the event or activity occurred and is sufficiently intact to convey that relationship to an observer.

Integrity is based on significance: why, where and when a property is important. Only after significance is fully established can the issue of integrity be addressed. Four primary steps must be taken to assess integrity of a property:

- Define the *essential physical features* that must be present for a property to represent its significance.
- Determine whether the *essential physical features are visible* enough to convey their significance.
- Determine whether the property needs to be *compared with similar properties*. And
- Determine, based on the significance and essential physical features, *which aspects of integrity* are particularly vital to the property being nominated and if they are present.